arXiv:0908.3491v2 [quant-ph] 3 Sep 2009

Entangled games do not require much entanglement (withdrawn)

Gus Gutoski[*]

September 2, 2009

Recent developments

On August 31, 2009 I discovered a mistake in my proof of Theorem 1. I describe this mistake below. On September 1, 2009 I was informed that William Slofstra is currently preparing a paper which contains a proof that strategies for XOR games can require an exponential amount of entanglement in order to be implemented exactly in the worst case. Slofstra's result strongly contradicts my Theorem 1. In particular, if my proof of Theorem 1 can be fixed then such a fix will necessarily entail an exponential weakening of the bound on shared entanglement.

It may yet be possible to modify the approach of the original version of this paper so as to obtain such a bound. However, the fact that (i) I have not been able to find a fix for my proof of Theorem 1 in an acceptable amount of time since discovering the mistake, and (ii) there is another result which contradicts my own, I am forced to conclude that a timely withdrawal of my submission is the only remaining option.

The mistake

Near the top of page 8 of the original version of this paper, there appears a sentence that begins as follows:

> Given that $\lambda_{\min}(\rho_s)\Pi_{\mathcal{A}_s\otimes\mathcal{F}_\rho} \preceq \rho_s$, it follows …

However, this is not given. The spaces $\mathcal{A}_s$ and $\mathcal{F}_\rho$ were defined earlier in the proof by

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{A}_s &= \mathrm{im}(\mathrm{Tr}_{\mathcal{F}}(\rho_s))\\ \mathcal{F}_\rho &= \mathrm{im}(\mathrm{Tr}_{\mathcal{A}}(\rho_s)).\end{aligned}$$

Unfortunately, the spaces $\mathcal{A}_s$ and $\mathcal{F}_\rho$ could have high dimension, whilst ρ_s could be supported on a space of low dimension. Such a circumstance could occur if, say, ρ_s is an entangled pure state.

Thank you

Since the original version of this paper was made public, I have corresponded with many people. To those who spent their time offering helpful suggestions, I offer my gratitude. To everyone, I apologize for this mistake.

---

[*] Institute for Quantum Computing and School of Computer Science, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada.